

Doctrinal Development

Q. What is the relation of (a) theology, (b) dogma, to divine revelation?

Theology: the theses on which you are examined

Dogma: the affirmations of the councils: si quis dixerit... anathema sit

Divine revelation: what is contained in verbo Dei scripto et tradito

1. The question exists

Theology and dogma are not explicitly and formally in SScr: three persons in one substance; one person in two natures; supernatural order; seven signs efficacious of grace; visible society hierarchically organized with primacy of jurisdiction and infallibility in Roman Pontiff.

Historically untenable that they are explicitly and formally in tradition: Peter whispered the homousion to his successor, etc. Cyril, 1150, 1230

2. Liberal answer: Harnack: Dogma is the result of transplanting the Gospel from the religious soil of Hebrew culture to the philosophic soil of Hellenism; it is a mutation; cuts communications between Gospel and Church; instead of sermon on Mount we have Canon Law; instead of the parables we have disputed questions on unicum esse and scientia media.

3. Modernist answer: Pascendi. Much more convincingly worked out in terms of existentialist philosophy.

H. Jonas, Augustin und das paulinische Freiheitsproblem, Gottingen 1930

The existential experience: Rom 7; the symbolic objectification and interpretation (God, Adam and Eve, Christ and grace, Parousia); the misinterpretation of the symbolic objectification (ontological categories)

Is Christ God? What on earth do you mean? Religious reality is basic human experience, which has an exigence for symbolic expression; symbolic expressions are to be handled dialectically

4. Catholic position. Implicitly in revelation. Somehow there is a "proof" for dogmas and theses to be got out of SScr, Tradition

But what does "implicit" mean? There is no strictly logical process that reaches conclusions with terms that do not occur in premisses. Homousion, two natures in one person, supernatural, signs efficacious of grace, etc., are not in premisses. Cf. 1 above.

Implicit has to mean some type of (a) transposition (b) equivalence.

To determine exactly what type of transposition and of equivalence is involved is the crux of whole question of relation of SScr to theology, of revelation to dogma, of what precisely we are about in 4 yrs theology.

5. If analogy does not lie in syllogism, perhaps it does lie in empirical science

a) Eddington's two tables

weight to mass, heat to temperature, light and power to vector fields, material things to chemical elements

transformation of subject: Thales did not see well; scientist observes very carefully, but what he sees is just what no one pays any attention to; scientist is not a biological unit intelligently and rationally dealing with scientist qua scientist does not operate in dramatico-ractical pattern of experience, but in a quite different intellectual pattern; erws of mind

b) Theology presents the same two features

Object: from God of Abraham, Isaac, Jacob, the One who..., sending his Son as promised, sending Holy spirit -

Subject: from concrete, undifferentiated consciousness; not just intellect but also will, image, feeling, emotion, sentiment

to object: one substance and three persons

to subject: just what do you mean, just what follows, how sure are you

c) Theological (dogmatic) transposition is from manifold of Christian living to system of terms and relations
just as scientific transposition is from manifold of human sensitive experience to system of terms and relations

d) Theological equivalence is like scientific: not one-to-one correspondence, as in a poor, word-for-word translation; but
via resolutionis (analytica) et inventionis
via compositionis (synthetica) et doctrinae

6. This analysis fits the broad historical facts.

Because theology is the emergence of a theoria in the minds of theoretici, because dogma is the divinely guaranteed ecclesiastical approbation of elements of theology,

a) theology and dogma are not there from the beginning

b) they emerge slowly, occasionally,

c) they are under suspicion, resisted

d) they come to be regarded as the essence of Catholic truth and divine revelation (J S Lawton, Conflict in Christology) (World Council of Christian Churches: Christ is Lord; that is all apostle's creed says)

7. Development, not transplantation into soil of Hellenism but into soil of human intelligence, fides quaerens intellectum
Categories of Nicaea, Chalcedon, etc not hellenistic

8. Not from experience and symbol to ontological misinterpretation
The ontology is already there: in the affirmations of VT and NT

Not just that God is revealed, but truths about God are revealed by God (Barth, Hermann Diem)

Issues are epistemological, metaphysical; on nature of faith

9. What is the good of it?

individual

a) The good of it is not ~~as~~ easily discerned in undifferentiated religious consciousness: it is without images, sentiment, emotion, feeling, acts of will

b) but individual undifferentiated consciousness is a vast multiplicity: individual differs from individual, village from village, region from region, age from age

the possibility of One Catholic Church does not lie on the level of immediate undifferentiated consciousness: there is the vitality the variety the One Catholic is possible in virtue of a theoria that is tied down to no particular type of consciousness, that rises only under the domination of the pure desire to know, the effectiveness of the notion of being

c) again, the good of it is the possibility of integrating one's concrete religious life with one's culture, one's sociology, one's economics, one's politics

development is always awkward: growing boy

there is the higher integration that combines both feeling compunction and defining it, pleasing the Trinity and discoursing learnedly on the Trinity

d) in the measure that one grasps precisely the nature of development, one can unite in a single view SScr and theology, revelation and dogma, ~~with~~ unite in the rhythm of a single human living the Withdrawal

and return that now is engaged in religious experience and now in DB 1796