

45200DTE060

The Second Problematic

- 1 The development of dogmas and of theology
Positive theology
 - 2 Theological notions
church, body of Christ
tradition
 - 3 Works
influence society
-

- 1 The social mediation of the good
- 2 Meaning
- 3 Meaning in social mediation
- 4 The historical dimension
- 5 The obscurity of history – Lebens Kämpfe
- 6 The obscurity of history – cognitional theory
- 7 The historical process
- 8 Historical inquiry
- 9 Theological categories

[page 2]

Obscurity regarding the nature of history

Lebens Kämpfe [Rothacker p. ¹

- A – the modern age is a new age, *Neuzeit*, deliberate intention
cf. _____ on historical consciousness. Behold I make all things new.
– every human action, especially social, supposes history
cf. amnesia
the modern age had to make its own history, its own interpretation of the past
it could not accept Catholic conservatism
- B – Protestants go back to scripture alone
because the intervening age was a corruption of religion
attack upon the church, upon Scholasticism
where we appeal to _____ existential history, tradition _____
they have to _____ interpretation _____
- C – Rationalists jettisoned positive religion: *écrasez l'infâme*
eternal truth |
positive relative values | e.g. laicism, in the state, education, laws

¹ [Lonergan is referring to Erich Rothacker, *Logik und Systematik der Geisteswissenschaften*. In his notes on the first problematic he refers to the 1947 edition (Bonn). The original was published in 1927. In the 1965 edition (Munich), which may well be simply a reprint, there is a section entitled 'Methoden, Weltanschauungen und Lebenskämpfe,' pp. 107-13.]

D – Romantics reacted against classicism | individual, abstract laws rules precepts _____
Romantic hermeneutics | ancient, barbarian[?], gothic, unusual
| _____, natural, cult of genius
| spontaneity, intelligence in the concrete

Romantic hermeneutics

The interpreter places himself in the place of the author, puts on the author's mind, feelings in some sense, as if he were to reproduce his work

Schleiermacher, even Dilthey

[page 3]

Hegelians Erkenntnis durch Begriffe (knowledge through concepts)

(1) not in a rationalistic deductive way (ontological argument)

but in a concrete way so as to include the temporal positively

(2) supposing the validity of Kantian immanentism but

restoring the validity of pure reason

not only regulative but constitutive of knowledge

(3) such reason is identified with the real

that is, not with being but with that which

fills the empty form of time

with 'the already out there now ...'

with the already in here now

that is, with the process from matter through the psychic to concepts

it proceeds therefore by [toward?] concepts, does not follow/judge them

this reason is dialectical

cf. _____ | *die Wendung zur Idee*

| the historical process teaches

(4) Religions (of which the most perfect is Christianity)

are but the apprehensions of imagination

concerning truth, which is perfectly known only by philosophy

(5) thus the supernatural is located within the field of natural knowledge

The Historical School – Niebuhr, Ranke, C.v. de Savigny

(1) rejected Hegelian apriorism

(2) sought understanding in the data themselves

(3) find every age in equal proximity to God

(4) but written history also demands something more general, which they tacitly assume

from the Enlightenment, Hegelianism

Dilthey

[page 4]

Time

Objective number and measure

[which is complete on the side of the object]

there is given one principal movement – of the highest celestial sphere

there is not given: _____ – Newton
systematization of many perspectives – Einstein

Subjective: [not false, but what is immediately in the subject]

the now of a being – immobile, eternal
mobile: not continuous – aevum
continuous – time

mobile | as one

| as many – mechanical interdependence whole not more than parts
spiritual intentional interdependence as _____
as in a symphony – representation of time
the earlier prepare the later
the later fulfill the earlier
the simultaneous are organically harmoniously united

|memory _____

|common institutions

social |cooperations the present is the center from which all are somehow present
|good of order intentionally |not of the subject
|problems the center is not fixed but moves, is fluid – |not of the inten obj
|but of psy/inten acts

The action of the subject is basically in the intentional order:

knowing, willing, executing
content, specification is intentional
reality is psychological event
subject identical _____

Something

here re:

individuum

[page 5]

The knowledge of social mediation [= society]

1 It is already known from daily use: the use by which each one knows well enough in diverse circumstances what is to be said, done, achieved in order to arrive at chosen ends.

2 But this knowledge

(1) is descriptive not theoretical – quoad nos, not quoad se
(2) is practical not theoretical – what is to be said, done, achieved
in accord with social ideals, sentiments, _____
in accord with pragmatic utility

(3) is fragmentary – it is not whole and entire in individual minds but divided and distributed in parts among everyone

3 But this knowledge is itself the first and fundamental constitution of social mediation.

For this mediation itself either totally (religion, education, science) or formally pertains to the intentional order.

By these intentions there are de facto constituted what are de facto intended by human beings.

[page 6]

4 Still, this first constitution tends to become more theoretical: *die Wendung zur Idee*.

e.g., education in accord with philosophical and psychological principles

morality in accord with a philosophical ethics

right and laws not from custom, from the discretion of a judge

but from codes [the judge becomes a functionary]

states not as historically developed by customs

but grounded in written constitutions

thought out, _____

5 The social mediation itself, like Aristotelian motion, is an act of something existing in potency as such – eye in _____

The idea itself is not realized but there is a tendency toward it.

Rather, many opposed ideas – cf. a battle, each one planning to conquer the other

the idea (a) the idea itself is only imperfectly understood, conceived

imperfectly that is, 'utopia' is not absolute _____ of a name

imperfectly (b) what is conceived is better and more accurately understood by one than by
apprehended another

imperfectly (c) what is actually implemented often is far removed from common concepts
discerned (compromise, combinations)

in accord (d) motive the motive and the mobile are of little moment in functionary
with life mobile personal motives influence to the extent that _____
and to the extent that what is mobile is dominated [?]

[page 7]

The Historical Process

Horizon – includes all that can be apprehended, chosen, done in accord with acquired habits

Situation – all that are as they are

the known part of the situation – what falls within the horizon

the hidden part of the situation – that lies beyond the horizon

Events – broadly what was said done achieved

strictly whatever happens according to, contrary to, or apart from intention

Events according to intention manifest the known part of a situation

Events contrary to or apart from intention manifest the hidden part of the situation

The historical process teaches obscurely, slowly, effectively

It teaches from events

It can teach clearly, e.g., the event _____ manifests errors _____

It teaches obscurely, for the horizon is not known, is the limit to which _____,
solicitude, care tends; there is no concern or meaning beyond the limit.

The situation is less known. It includes what is beyond the horizon.

The intention is now more clear, now more obscure.

No one starts a war in order to be defeated

‘on applique le règlement’

It teaches effectively, for if the horizon remains the same, errors and evils continually
recur

[unclear line except for ‘potest’]

It teaches slowly, for one error tends to take the place of another.

[page 8]

Classical Gadamer *Wahrheit und Methode* 269 ss.

1 What is significant at any time [freedom from particular ____ brilliant but for us today]
good at any time
_____ in time _____

2 Humanistic Greek and Roman literature & art as chief instance of 1

3 High point in Greek and Roman

4 High point (telos to which advance
from which decline in any culture)

Classicist the merely abstract is not a lie, provided they know it is abstract
Treatment of A [abstract] as if scientific concepts, strict universals
thinking in abstract vacuum
liberté fraternité égalité
everyday [?] world as basis of abstract rights
abstract constitution

Romanticist hermeneutic *Einfühlung* Empathy
 Einsicht Insight *Mitvollzug*

motion = of the existent in potency as such
die Wendung zur Idee

[page 9]

Historical inquiry

1 The matter is made more complex because here epistemological questions tend to be asked.
That is, the modern world has rejected the Christian view of the world
hence it had to construct according to another norm

Protestants had to conceive history ____ New Testament _____
Rationalists had recourse to the distinction between eternal truth and temporal relative
(positivism)

Hegel wanted Erkenntnis durch Begriffe
not in a rationalistic way (ontological argument)
but in a concrete way that included positive facts
supposing Kantian immanentism
but restoring the value of reason
this reason is identified with the real
i.e., with the process from matter through sense to concepts
i.e., it precedes rather than follows concepts
this reason is dialectical (cf. above, *die Wendung zur Idee*)

Gadamer WM pp. 162 –

die historische Schule (Niebuhr, Ranke, C.v.Savigny)
rejected Hegelian apriorism
sought understanding in investigating the singular
easily retained notions, suppositions, from the Enlightenment and Hegelianism

W. Dilthey wanted neither the incoherence of the Historical School
nor the apriorism of Hegel
but a critique of historical reason
that is, the conditions of possibility for firmly establishing the
human sciences not on Newtonian grounds but on historical, human grounds

Heidegger renewed the hermeneutical question
some understanding of oneself and one's situation is constitutive of *Dasein*
this understanding includes some *Geschichtlichkeit*
hence the "objective" historical method does not suffice

In different ways, positivists, empiricists, skeptics have recourse to collecting data,
empirical historical judgments

[page 10]

2 Historical inquiry intends an acceleration of the historical process.

What that process teaches obscurely, slowly, and with qualified effectiveness
the historian wishes to teach clearly and briefly.

Hence, those who are ignorant of history repeat it.

There is no contemporary history, since the events have not yet revealed the situation

There is no ____ universal history before the day of judgment – future events

Partial [?] history some events manifest situation – e.g., a battle

3 [Historical inquiry] consists of three steps:

(a) Experiential – regarding the sources – discovery Qumran: who did what, what also ____
publication with apparatus, indices
crisis time, place, author

[exp] in relation to principles of historical inquiry

(b) Understanding – hermeneutics

hermeneutic circle: part understood from whole interdependence

whole understood from parts intentional
every whole is situation in a larger whole
part of a work in the whole work
each work in all one's works
all one's works to the works of one's predecessors, contemporaries, and
subsequent interpreters

this does not involve an infinite series

operative grace independent genetic series
 about operation, divine, human, volitional, free
 about habitual and actual grace, providence,
 predestination

Lexicon most important nouns and verbs – from other texts
 where there are others of less importance –
 from other texts, etc.
 but the circle is closed when one arrives at the
 fundamentals
 the importance vanishes the more one departs from the
 primary intention

Technical – what is the Logos in the Prologue to John?

It is X = what was in the beginning, was with God, was God, all
things through him, _____ light of men, _____ of his fullness, Bapt. John the
Father

[marginal]

scientific :laws of economics

??

philosophical

theological

[page 11]

(c) historical judgment – *laissez parler les faits* – not only stylistic artifice
 not only opinion of empiricists
that is, the historical process contains judgments
what periods, epochs, is a certain greater change of horizon [?]
 which 3 lines not decipherable

history of itself terminates at some doctrine

this history is a process by which societies slowly are taught and learn
both from what was done well – whence things proceed happily
and from errors and what was not done well

indeed there are many sources and possibilities of error

also when some new plan is proposed, it is criticized from all sides. Arguments of every
kind can and ought to be made. But no argument can be made from the outcome.

An argument that is properly historical is made from the whole course of events. Historical understanding tends in that direction. With that end in view, the sources are sought, examined, evaluated.

[page 12]

Historical criticism

The narrating of history occurs within the historical process.

It is done in a situation, under a horizon, with respect to the situation and horizon of others.

Thus the event, the historical work, teaches by way of the historian's situation and horizon.

Historical criticism gathers together this teaching.

Minor: a written history from past events e.g., about economics 1920 to 1940

Major: from the correction of the method itself

from a philosophical critique: horizon from individual, group, general bias

primarily and per se affects the historians themselves

from a theological critique: sinful mankind – Romans 1-3

necessity of grace

[page 13]

Historical inquiry (a more general overview)

1 (a) not about _____, ordering, _____ etc., the work

(b) but about what was previously known that _____ the experienced

(c) we make not a separation but a distinction: that is, the composition provides an occasion for further questions which _____ inasmuch as further _____

2 The inquiry is accomplished in three steps: experiential, interpretative, critical.

Experiential: there are sought and discovered sources, data (documents, monuments)

traces of the past existing in the present

publications, catalogues, indices, etc.

introductions – data which respect time, place, author

the data themselves can immediately be submitted to interiorization, crisis

because of specialization

if this happens, later a further and deeper crisis

Intellectual: first, hermeneutical, seeking the meaning of the documents

hermeneutic circle: parts from the whole, whole from the parts, ?? intentional

It is solved when one arrives at the act of understanding; that is, it satisfies all the questions that have a bearing on the matter. But what those are that have a bearing on the matter is the work of wisdom. There seems to be an infinite regress: the paragraph in the chapter, the chapter in the book, the book in a work, the work in all one's works, all one's works in ___ the works of one's predecessors, contemporaries.

Marginal (with reference to solving the hermeneutic circle): the intelligible in the sensible, not in the manner of science but in the manner of common sense. One act and another complete, correct, a habit is attained by which one is added to others, causes are understood, contingency is understood.

[page 14]

But there only seems [to be an infinite regress]. There is a tendency to a limit; if it is not in the question that was first put, the question itself can be modified.

E.g., 'Gratia operans': an interdependent genetic series
concerning operation: in general, human, divine, voluntary, free
concerning habitual and actual grace in their diverse aspects
the causes of the changes can be determined from newly available documents
(e.g., Augustine)
although it is not clear what the old doctrine on operative grace was,
the process at least is well determined

E.g., Lexikon not of nouns and verbs according to their nominal definitions
but from the author's usage
from the principal text – to others where more directly
assistance, habit, motion are treated
where, however, there is another context _____
but the more one moves away from the center, the less it is significant
and the more one approaches the fundamental concepts the more the ultimate ? illuminate

E.g. technique: What is the *Logos* in the prologue of John?

- (a) _____ are enumerated, their arguments and counter-arguments
- _____ infinite
- (b) Logos = X: X was in the beginning, with God, God, everything through
him, nothing without him
Every interpretation of the Logos must keep these features,
even after eliminating ambiguities and improbabilities, there is
a fixed center
- (c) the question is limited to clarifying certain elements

the marginal material

is not clear: Latin --

opp mutilatio

(1) generatim ex principiis plus minus specul

unde ?

quod semper probatione indigent

ii probationes facerent

(2) in canonicis non admittitur

[page 15]

_____ hermeneutic
an opening of the horizon is operating
author cannot be interpreted according to presupposed _____
e.g., Molinists _____ investigation, the text reads thus.
gradually so many difficulties _____, that
another problematic of St. Thomas is _____

the more profound the author is, the more he belongs to another age, culture,
civilization,
the more he uses _____ of apprehending, thinking, judging, speaking
the greater is the opening of the horizon.

A second interpretative

Now with the hermeneutic itself, not only the text but the subject matter is understood, and indeed not by scientific laws or by philosophical or theological principles, but by common sense. Just as by common sense, from our learning through our experience of human living, we understand and judge everything, so does the historian acquire the common sense of another age.

[page 16]

a second interpretative

just as the experience of life is completed and illuminated by the human sciences
so also is historical interpretation
-- from depth psychology, from economics, from law _____
an perhaps even more profoundly from cognitional theory, philosophy, theological
doctrine regarding sin (Romans 1-3) and grace, the need for it, its existence and effects

(c) critical: the historical work itself is a historical event
judicial – it regards a situation in the light of a horizon
from which different historians will say different things about the same matter
this discrepancy is an occasion for reflection
as an event opens an ancient horizon
so historical books manifest a historical horizon
minor: later authors, because they are later, know about more events
e.g., the history of economics in the 19th century, in 1920, 1940
hence _____ of relative distance – after judgment day, no more human history
greater after a battle, greater after the war
the greatest concerning fundamental ideas of a certain culture
_____ in Greco-Roman history – is motion
entered, influenced through learned men only
major: what regards the method itself
what scientific knowledge brings in – e.g., depth psychology
what philosophical knowledge brings in

what theological knowledge brings in

[page 17]

judicial on *laisse parler les faits*
 not [confusing] facts with data
 not a literary artifice – judgment is not explicitly mentioned
 but carefully insinuated in _____
 but from the very nature of the matter
that is, the historical process itself teaches, even if obscurely, with qualified
effectiveness, slowly
 by implying situation and horizons
 regarding history
 regarding historians themselves
equally, historical narration can teach the same things more briefly, more clearly,
more distinctly

it teaches (1) the opening of horizon
 (2) the genesis of the actual situation, and once the genesis is understood,
 the terminus is understood
 (a) in the disciplines, sciences, philosophy
 (b) in human affairs
 history terminates at a doctrine
 (3) human _____ in the state not of pure nature but
 as it actually is and operates
 (4) the body of Christ: from its very action, from its function in
 universal history